

David Hiley

## The Sequence Melodies sung at Cluny and elsewhere

Note: sequence melodies are cited in quotes, e.g. "Captiva"; sequence texts are cited in italics, e.g. *Summi triumphum*.

Recent writing on the early sequence, particularly that of Richard Crocker<sup>1</sup>, has directed our attention to the close relationship between text and music, the way in which the shape of the melody supports the syntax and rhetorical plan of the text. Crocker has argued that this close mutual interdependence implies careful compositional planning on the part of author/composer, and is not likely to have emerged accidentally through the mechanical texting of older melodies. He challenges strongly the traditional belief that the sequence as a genre "grew" out of the alleluia as some sort of "trope"; he argues instead for a burst of quite new compositional activity during the 9th century, creating a repertory which was at length (not necessarily originally) assimilated into the liturgy, taking a place during mass after the alleluia.

Valuable as Crocker's ideas are, both as a corrective to assumptions too easily held and because they have placed human compositional choices squarely in the centre of the discussion, they have possibly had the effect of drawing too much attention away from the sequence melodies, which seem often to have circulated as such, without text. Whether or not sequences were originally composed as text and music together, the frequent re-texting of the melodies is one of the most salient features of the early repertory. The melodies apparently had a quasi-independent status not enjoyed by the texts; for the making of new melodies for old texts did not occur until a quite new repertory of regularly structured sequences was created in the 12th and 13th centuries, with a degree of uniformity which made the exchanging of melodies between texts a relatively simple matter.

In a recent paper, the distinguished dedicatee of these lines drew attention to the writing down of Notker's sequences as an early witness to the notation of music<sup>2</sup>. While one may be permitted to ask whether neumes and texts or simply texts alone

---

<sup>1</sup> Richard L. Crocker, *The Early Medieval Sequence*, Berkeley 1977. Id.: *Sequence (i)*, in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, London 1980, vol.17, pp.141-151.

<sup>2</sup> Helmut Huckle, *Die Anfänge der abendländischen Notenschrift*, in: *Festschrift Rudolf Elvers*, Tübingen 1985, pp.271-288; see p.273.

were copied on the scrolls for the boys to sing, the effect would have been to fix the shape of a sequence melody whenever and wherever Notker's text was sung. Texts known from other traditions go with melodies often formed differently, and the variation between versions often raises difficult questions as to how the different versions arose, before they in their turn were fixed in a written form. Crocker's thesis is that the starting point was a texted sequence. To this should still be opposed the older belief that, in some cases at least (and perhaps all the earliest cases), melodies were known simply as such, ecstatic in nature, elastic in form, capable of almost infinite extension and development. The texting, perhaps originally carried out at relatively few centres, then caught the melodies in a syllabic net, as it were. Written copies, whose natural tendency is to eliminate alternative versions, or at least act against their reaching written status, show relatively few different versions of the melodies.

Two of the main arguments in support of the idea that the sequences were often, if not originally, sung without texts, are: (i) substantially different versions of the melodies, often seen in the "West" and "East Frankish" examples discussed by Crocker, and in others not yet available in published form; and (ii) collections of melodies without texts. Of the latter, St. Gallen Stiftsbibliothek 484 is the best known<sup>3</sup>. But three other early collections have been little studied:

Angers, Bibliothèque municipale, 144 (136), from Angers, late 10th c.

Cambrai, Bibliothèque municipale, 75, from Arras, early 11th c.

Chartres, Bibliothèque municipale, 47, from Brittany, c. 900

The main purpose of this essay is to draw particular attention to these manuscripts, and also to the melodies in the somewhat later manuscript Paris, Bibl. Nationale, lat. 1087, from Cluny, which source also has a number of texted sequences. I have already had occasion to present an inventory of Chartres 47 and discuss its salient characteristics<sup>4</sup>. These are summarized briefly here. Inventories of the other sources follow. If the melodies were used in any of the three large repertoires of Winchester, the Aquitainian area, and the German-Swiss group of manuscripts, the concordances are given, together with texts and liturgical occasions. In Angers 144, Cambrai 75 and Paris 1087 nearly all the sequences are long, consisting mostly of paired versicles; short, a-parallel sequences are cited as

---

<sup>3</sup> See the lists of sequences in Wolfram von den Steinen, *Notker der Dichter und seine geistige Welt*, Bern 1948. New light has been shed on the earliest sources of St. Gall sequences by Susan Rankin, *The earliest sources of Notker's sequences: St Gallen, Vadiana 317, and Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale lat. 10587*, in: *Early Music History* 10 (1991), pp.201-233.

<sup>4</sup> David Hiley, *The sequentiary of Chartres, Bibliothèque Municipale, Ms. 47*, in: *La Sequenza medievale: Atti del Convegno Internazionale Milano 7-8 aprile 1984*, ed. Agostino Ziino, Lucca 1992, pp.105-117.

such. Chartres 47, on the other hand, has a relatively high proportion of short, a-parallel sequences.

### CHARTRES 47

The probable date of Chartres 47, c. 900, makes it one of the oldest of all known sequence collections, and it postdates Notker's activity at St. Gall only slightly. Even if a later date be preferred, the source seems likely to be as old as its only rival in antiquity, Paris 1240.

As already stated, I have commented elsewhere on some of the special features of the Chartres collection, in particular upon the significant "third" version of the "Laudes deo" melody (no.24). Where a "western" and "eastern" version of the melody are known which differ significantly in the length and number of lines, Chartres 47 sometimes has yet another version.

About a third of the Chartres melodies (10 out of 29) are short, a-parallel ones. There are none of the somewhat mysterious partially texted sequences found in other western sources (but not eastern ones); and there is no discernible liturgical order in the sequences.

Chartres 47 has a relatively high proportion of melodies known both in the east and the west, but among western sources it shows most affinity with Paris 1084 and 1118 (which have a considerable number of short a-parallel sequences found in Chartres 47 but not in later Aquitainian sources). The repertory breaks down as follows:

- 7 of its melodies were known all over Europe;
- 10 were known in both west and east, but are not in the Winchester books;
- 2 only are melodies found both in Aquitaine and in Winchester, but not in the East;
- 4 are found elsewhere only in western sources, but not in Winchester;
- 6 are apparently unique.

### ANGERS 144

(The sequences in Angers 144 are listed at the end of this article)

The north-French neumes of Angers 144<sup>5</sup>, of a type well known along the Loire valley, prepare us for a repertory which turns out to be largely concordant with other North French sources, in particular the Winchester ones. It has 27 different

---

<sup>5</sup> Bruno Stäblein gives a photograph of part of f.98r on page 111 of *Schriftbild der einstimmigen Musik*, Leipzig 1975 (= *Musikgeschichte in Bildern* iii/4).

melodies (28 if we choose to count nos.6 and 7 separately), and of these no less than 22 appear in the Winchester books. The breakdown by area is:

- 11 melodies known all over Europe;
- 8 known in both Winchester and Aquitaine, but not in the east;
- 3 less well known western melodies, not known in both Winchester and Aquitaine together;
- 3 unica.

There are no short, a-parallel sequences, and no partially-texted ones.

Parts of the series follow a liturgical order, but all is not straightforward, partly because the leaves are gathered haphazardly together<sup>6</sup>.

There is a clear progression of saints' days from the feasts of the Blessed Virgin on f.97r up to Andrew in the middle of f.97v (nos.5 to 10). There follow sequences for the temporale from Christmas to Pentecost at the top of f.98r (nos.11-17). The next item, for Peter and Paul, is in a suitable place (but logically would precede n.5), but among the next pieces no logical order is discernible - the liturgical assignments in other sources cannot be juggled to produce a satisfactory succession for Angers 144. And, if the usual assignments of these melodies are a guide, nos.24 (usually for Easter) and 26-27 (usually for Christmas) are out of order. The items used to fill up ff.95v and 96r are likewise not easy to fit into an order. In particular one would hope to see sequences for the Purification and John the Baptist here. But since the uses of nos.2 (only known otherwise from Chartres 47) and 3 (unicum) are unknown, and since no.9 is rubricated for St. Martin, an assignment quite unknown elsewhere, it is clearly unwise to push the argument much further, and we may consider these as items simply entered as space allowed.

---

<sup>6</sup> The manuscript, containing Eusebius' homilies, originally ended with "EXPLICIT" at the foot of f.95r. At the top of f.95v are copied the text incipit of the St. Peter offertory *Constitues eos*, with three fully notated verses (René-Jean Hesbert, *Antiphonale Missarum Sextuplex*, Brussels 1935, no.122b.). The second sequence, "Adtendite" ends at the foot of f.95v. Folio 96 is only half a leaf, with notation only on its recto, and f.97r. was probably not originally consecutive. Sequence no.4, that is the second one on f.96r, is copied in a different hand: it lacks an initial "A" (for "Alleluia"), and the wavy red line that is set under all the other melodies. It has occasional significative letters, does not use an elongated apostrophe-like shape for the final punctum in a climacus, and occasionally writes the pes stratus cadence typical of sequences as three puncta instead of in a single "cup + wave" shape. Folio 96v, with a non-liturgical text, was also probably originally blank. To judge by the size of the collection, it may well be more or less complete. Folio 99 contains chant texts for the feast of the Annunciation (Hesbert no.33a, in the series of the "Silvanectensis"), spaced ready to receive notation which was never entered.

## CAMBRAI 75

(Te sequences in Cambrais 75 are listed at the end of this article)

With 24 concordances with the Winchester repertory, Cambrai 75 reinforces the impression already given by its trope repertory, of close repertorial links between the area of Corbie and Arras and pre-Conquest Winchester<sup>7</sup>. The breakdown of sequences by area is:

- 14 known all over Europe (a high proportion of the 17 in this category);
- 1 only (no.22) known in both west and east but not in Winchester;
- 8 common throughout the west;
- 3 less well-known western melodies;
- 1 melody (no.29) which has probably "strayed" in from the east;
- 2 peculiar to books of the Arras area (nos.3 and 23);
- 1 unicum (no.25).

Two common melodies with partial text appear, "Fulgens" and "Pretiosa", but no short a-parallel sequence.

The collection follows a clear liturgical order, and it would not be difficult to suggest a complementary collection of texts for this series, with only one or two gaps. **Table 1** (see end of article) puts items from the repertory of later Arras books alongside the melodies of Cambrai 75. Arras Bibl. municipale 437 is an early 13th-century gradual from St Vaast; Arras 444 is a late 13th-century noted missal; and the series from the printed missal of Arras of 1491 was also consulted. Regrettably, both Arras 437 and 444 have some crucial lacunae.

Some peculiarities of the series need explanation. Firstly, the provision of only three Advent melodies at the beginning can be understood as an archaic feature, deriving from the fact that the 4th Sunday of Advent was for long without a mass<sup>8</sup>. In the Amiens missal of 1487 one still finds that *Salus eterna* is to be sung on the first three Sundays and no sequence on the fourth; and Auxerre 6, representing Tours use, has only three sequences: *Salus*, *Regnantem* and *Qui regis*. In the case of Arras use, it is possible that no texts were sung to these melodies until relatively late. There are no Advent sequences at the start of the collections in Arras 437 and 444, and not because of lacunae. Confirmation of this comes from two manuscripts from nearby Cambrai, Cambrai, Bibl. municipale, 60 and 78. The Cambrai parallel

---

<sup>7</sup> On the tropes, see above all Alejandro Planchart, *The Repertory of Tropes at Winchester*, Princeton 1977. Also my article *Some observations on the interrelationships between trope repertories*, in: G.Iversen, ed., *Research on Tropes*, Konferenser 8, Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, for the Kungl. Vitterhets Historie och Antikvitets Akademien, 1983, pp.29-38. On the more general relationship between the areas, see my paper *Thurstan of Caen and plainchant at Glastonbury - musicological reflexions on the Norman Conquest*, in: *Proceedings of the British Academy* 72 (1986), pp.57-90.

<sup>8</sup> Hesbert no.7bis.

is particularly close because our Arras manuscript has unusual versions of melodies nos.1 and 2 which to my knowledge are found elsewhere only in Cambrai 60 and 78; furthermore, Arras no.3, "Excita", is a double-versicle sequence probably preferred to the normal short a-parallel "Excita" melody (see Paris 1087 no.B4 below), again only known from Cambrai and Arras books.

Cambrai, Bibl. municipale, 60 (gradual, Cambrai, 11th-12th c.)

Its sequence collection is mostly of texted items, but it begins with eight untexted melodies (the first has a partial text):

f1. f.117r	De omnibus sanctis	Cambrai 75 no.19
2.	In adventu domini	" 1
3. 117v	Dominica ii	" 2
4.	Dominica ii <i>	" 3
5.	Dominica iii <i>	" 8
6.	De martyris. Unus amor	" 6
7.	Alia	" 7
8.	Musca	" 28

Then begins the long series of texted items, starting unusually with sequences for St. Andrew and St. Nicholas before the Christmas batch. They include *Unus amor et una concordia*, for Stephen (cf. no.6), but instead of *Organicis* or *Oramus te* for St. John Evangelist (cf. no.7) we find Notker's *Johannes Jesu Christo*, one of several importations from the German area.

Cambrai, Bibl. municipale, 78 (soloist's book, Cambrai, 11th-12th c.)

All its sequences are texted, and for the most part the series is identical to that of Cambrai 60. It starts, however, with four uncommon texts for the Advent melodies, *Ecce gratulemur* (for Cambrai 75 no.1), *Concurramus devoti* (for no.2), *Excita domine magnam potentiam* (for no.3) and *Diem natalem* (for no.8). Although one might argue that these texts were a replacement for the popular *Salus eterna* group, it is also possible that they were newly composed for melodies previously sung without text, to bring them into line with the rest of the repertory.

Printed missal of Arras, 1491.

For Advent this book and its printed successors have four other texts<sup>9</sup>. *Gaude et exsulta tellus* is for Cambrai 75 no.1. There follows a reversion to the more normal form of no.2, with not the usual "western" *Regnantem sempiterna* but Notker's *Psallat ecclesia*. For no.3, as far as I can tell, comes *Cunctipotens pater pie*, though its line and syllable count demands a different first line and there is no final single line. The last text of the Arras 1491 set, *Eia iuxta vera prophetica*, has a line and syllable count close to that of the "Dulce lignum" melody, used for texts of the Holy Cross such as *Salve crux sancta*, but I know no source of the melody. At any rate it is not in the earlier manuscripts. It is therefore possible that the sequence of events may have been similar to that at Cambrai: a late texting of previously wordless melodies, resulting in some peculiar local items. In this case recourse was also had to a well-known text, *Psallat ecclesia*, which drove out the local version of the melody.

<sup>9</sup> Three are printed in *Analecta Hymnica* 39, nos.2-4.

Returning to Cambrai 75, somewhere between nos. 15 (for Ascension) and 17 (for Trinity) one would expect a Whitsuntide sequence. But in the Arras area it was usual to sing another version of *Fulgens preclara* on Whitsunday: this is the case in Arras 437 and 444, for example.

The appearance of the "Iubilemus" melody after Christmas is puzzling: possibly it is to be associated with the old mass "In natale Sanctae Mariae" on January 1st<sup>10</sup>.

The idea that a church may have continued to sing only sequence melodies when texts had long been sung elsewhere is not definitely proven by the Arras case. But it receives further support from the last manuscript to be discussed here.

## PARIS 1087

(the sequences in Paris 1087 are listed at the end of this article)

Paris 1087 has been dated as early as the late 10th century but is almost certainly to be assigned to the late 11th<sup>11</sup>. This oft-cited, but still all too little known source contained originally a small series of texted sequences<sup>12</sup>, followed by a longer series of melodies, then one final texted item. (The two sequences on f.117v-118 are later additions and will not be mentioned again<sup>13</sup>. Although this may seem haphazard, there is nothing accidental about the careful copying and finishing, with ornate penwork, of the collection: everything looks intentional rather than provisional.

Mostly thanks to the text incipits used as melody titles, there is rarely any doubt as to what feasts the sequences were intended for. On closer inspection, it appears

<sup>10</sup> Hesbert no. 16bis.

<sup>11</sup> *Les Sources* gives 994-1048, the years of Odilo's abbacy, presumably on the grounds that his office appears as an addition (see Vezin, in: *Scriptorium* 21 (1967), pp.312-320). In my article *Cluny, sequences and tropes*, in: *La tradizione dei tropi liturgici*, ed. C. Leonardi and E. Menesto, Spoleto 1990, 125-138, I have accepted the later dating indicated by Meyer Schapiro, *The Parma Ildefonsus, a romaneseque illustrated manuscript from Cluny*, New York 1964. My article contains a brief discussion of the Cluny sequence repertory as a prelude to an investigation of Cluny's use of tropes.

<sup>12</sup> In *RISM B/V/1* p.123, Heinrich Husmann pointed out that the melodies for the texts are written in the margin, German-wise. Nevertheless, the texts, and therefore the melodies, run over the ends of lines: that is, they are not copied so that a new phrase begins a new line, as in early German sources. The phrase structure and shape of the melody is therefore much less immediately grasped than in manuscripts of, say, St. Emmeram Regensburg. The difference will be appreciated if the facsimiles given on pp.185 and 187 of Stäblein's *Schriftbild* are inspected.

<sup>13</sup> One of statutes of Peter the Venerable, abbot 1122-56, compiled 1146/7, stipulates the introduction of *Caeleste organum* for the 2nd Mass of Christmas Day: "The reason this was instituted was because the one beginning *Nostra tuba* was a rude ("incompta") series of words and scarcely at all pertinent to the saviour's birth, and long esteemed for a melody yet more rude; everyone perceived this, and it was displeasing." See the edition by Giles Constable, in: *Consuetudines Benedictinae Variarum, Corpus Consuetudinum Monasticum*, ed. Kassius Hallinger, vol.VI, Siegburg 1975, pp.19-106, this statute no.58, p.88. Melody D2 therefore replaced B6 in Table 2.

that the series are complementary. The series of melodies omits items for masses already supplied with a texted sequence. Combining the two, the liturgical order would run as given in **Table 2** (see end of article).

The rest of the collection cannot be placed so exactly. B22-25 were all used for various saints, and none has a particularly good claim to any one feast. It is odd that Michael (September 29), All Saints (November 1) and Martin (November 10) are not more obviously represented, though one would then expect them to follow B26, which is very common for the Nativity of the Blessed Virgin (September 25). It is not unusual to find the Dedication sequence (B27) and something for the Invention and Exaltation of the Holy Cross (B28) near the end of a collection.

Some idea of how the collection would have been used can be gained from Cluny customs, which also support the notion that many sequences remained untexted at Cluny. Two important texts are:

(i) the "Liber Tramitis", representing the customs under Abbot Odilo (994-1048), in a recension made for Farfa, the imperial abbey in the Sabine mountains about 40 km. north-east of Rome<sup>14</sup>;

(ii) the customary of the monk of Cluny, Udalric (1029-1093), written about 1079-80, that is, during the abbacy of Hugh (1049-1109)<sup>15</sup>. Udalric, or Ulrich von Zell, wrote the work for Abbot William of Hirsau, in order to provide information about Cluny for German monasteries; he was a native of Regensburg, where he had been educated with William.

In the "Liber Tramitis", no sequences are mentioned by name or text. References are simply to the singing of a "sequentia", at the missa maiora on the 1st Sunday in Advent, Thomas the Apostle, Easter Sunday, John Baptist and on his Octave, the Octave of the Translation of Benedict, Luke, and the Octave of Martin. For the last, the words "sequentiam melodient" are employed, which may indicate a textless state<sup>16</sup>. This list is clearly incomplete, since, among other things, it is hardly conceivable that a saint's octave would be dignified by a sequence when one was not sung on the main feast. Often the sequence is mentioned only in order to specify that bells should be rung during its performance.

Udalric is much more informative. Some references, not always correctly interpreted, have already appeared in previous writings. They appear in Book I, first in Chapter XI, as part of a general description of mass, then on various important days, whose liturgy demands a special description, beginning with Maundy Thursday.

---

<sup>14</sup> Peter Dinter, ed., *Liber Tramitis Aevi Odilonis Abbatis*, in: *Corpus Consuetudinum Monasticum*, ed. Kassius Hallinger, vol. X, Siegburg 1980.

<sup>15</sup> J.-P. Migne, *Patrologiae Latinae* Tomus 149, col.643-778.

<sup>16</sup> References can be located in the index to Dinter's edition. From this splendid list it can be seen that "melodiare" is used elsewhere only once, when the responsory *Beatus Vincentius* is sung at Vespers on the feast of "magnificentissimi Vincentii".

In Ch. XI Udalric lists saints' days when a sequence, clearly a textless melody, is to be sung: "post alleluia quaedam melodia neumarum cantatur, quod sequentiam quidam appellant, ut in Depositione S. Mauri, Nativitate S. Vincentii, in Conversione S. Pauli, in Natale apostolorum Philippi et Jacobi; in Inventione et Exaltatione S. Crucis; in Depositione S. Martialis, in Exceptione reliquiarum S. Gregorii, in Natali S. Jacobi, in Depositione S. Germani, in Inventione S. Stephani, in Octava Assumptionis S. Mariae, in Nativitate S. Bartolomaei, in Nativitate sanctorum Juliani et Hermetis, in Decollatione S. Joannis Baptistae, in Nativitate apostolorum Simonis et Judae, in Nativitate S. Quintini martyris; in Depositione S. Odonis abbatis; in Nativitate S. Thomae apostoli." This list, omitting the most important saints, complements Table 2 very well: that is, melodies B22-25 are for the saints on Udalric's list.

Udalric comments on texted sequences at the end of the same chapter: "Prosa, vel quod alii sequentiam vocant, non cantatur nisi in quinque festis principalibus, in Epiphania, in Ascensione Domini, in Translatione S. Benedicti, et in Nat. S. Mauricii." And there they are in Table 2: A1, A3, A5, A6 and A8 for the "principal feasts", and the other four as Udalric states."

For the mass of Easter Day (Ch. XV), Udalric says that several cantors have the duty of singing the prose (which one is not stated), to whom the choir answer "per neumas": the likeliest interpretation of this is that to each texted versicle the choir will answer with an untexted repeat, a performance practice often assumed today but infrequently stated in medieval sources. "Certain tropes", continues Udalric, are added to the Agnus Dei. During Easter week (Ch. XVI), further sequence melodies are sung: "post alleluia nescio quae Gallicanae neumae cantantur". He was quite correct: melodies B13-15 were not known in Germany.

Udalric's information about the singing of the Pentecost sequence has often been cited previously. Sensitive as always to national differences, Udalric states that "But although not all the French care very much for the proses of the Germans, nevertheless, the blessed father Odilo, being pressed and then allying himself with our countrymen, maintained that this one only, *Sancti spiritus adsit gratia*, might be sung on this day in our place." Udalric and his fellow German monks at Cluny won their point, and Notker's text was sung thenceforth<sup>17</sup>.

---

<sup>17</sup> "Quamvis autem omnis Galli non magnopere curent de prosis Teutonicorum, tamen beato Patre Odilone adnitente et de nostratibus aserente, haec sola, *Sancti spiritus adsit nobis gratia*, obtinuit ut in nostro loco in isto die cantaretur." (PL 149, 672). Hallinger's inference, drawn in Gorze-Kluny (Graz, 1971), p.948, that this illustrates a reluctance on the part of Cluniac congregations to sing "tropes" (read "sequence texts"), actively cultivated in eastern centres, seems rather bold, for Udalric does not state that no text was sung before Sancti spiritus gained a place. In any case, the objection of the French monks is surely to the style of the language (Notker's in this case), not the idea of texts in general. The general contrast between the more rhapsodical early French texts and the tougher German ones has often been discussed: see for example Crocker in the *New Grove Dictionary*, vol.17, p.146.

Nothing more is then said until Advent is reached. A sequence is to be sung on all the Sundays of Advent up to Christmas (Ch. XLIV). At the main mass of Christmas Day "post alleluia sequentia jubilatur" (Ch. XLVI). In contrast to what was suggested above (for melody B9), Udalric says no alleluia is to be sung on Holy Innocents' Day, presumably excluding also a sequence (Ch. XLVII).

In Book II the "prosa" is mentioned again, where it is stated that the armarius will point to the singers who are to perform it, "si quando est cantanda" (Ch. XXXI). This might be a reference to prosulas for office responsories, though the chants previously mentioned in the chapter are those of mass; another possibility is alleluia prosulas, of which one appears among the additions to f.1v (see the end of the list of Contents above). The singing of proses is also mentioned during the full description of the armarius' duties in Book III (Ch. X), where they are stated as being performed by four singers, two on the left and two on the right, with whom the armarius makes a fifth, usually on the right, since these will begin the first verse, and if they should chance not to be in concord, he will be prompt to support them.

It therefore seems that at Cluny few, if any sequence texts, were sung in its earlier period. Whether the introduction of *Sancti spiritus* was contemporary with the introduction of other texts, or whether it replaced an earlier one, is not clear. But there seems little reason to doubt that the collection of Paris 1087 reflects quite well the situation as described by Udalric.

The evidence of the early collections of sequence melodies just discussed suggests that not only might they be copied separately from corresponding texts, but they might also be performed without them. In view of the widely differing nature of the extant collections, it seems unwise to postulate a single line of development which might be valid for all places. A relatively stable repertory of texts was in existence in German lands by the mid-10th century, many of which go back to Notker's work at the end of the previous century. At Winchester, too, at the end of the 10th century, a completely texted sequence repertory existed, much of it created after first rejecting previously extant texts, as Notker did. Most of the melodies known in Aquitaine were texted by the same date, though nearly two dozen have no known text (half of them short a-parallel melodies). Other places, so it seems, did not sing texts, or introduced them only gradually. Chartres 47 cannot easily be understood as the counterpart to a lost collection of texts, nor does Angers 144 fit this picture easily. At Arras, at least the Advent sequences may be presumed to have been textless for some time, while at Cluny it seems that texts were sung only on the highest feasts.

There is no doubt that a prolonged search through the relevant medieval writings, and more intensive study of the musical sources, would reveal more evidence for the textless performance of sequences. As late as the 12th century, for example, one finds the anonymous French author of the *Speculum de misteriis ecclesiae*, at

the culmination of a rhapsodic disquisition on the alleluia and sequence, stating that "because the glories of the eternal life will not resound to human words, certain churches vocalize the sequence without words. For words' significance is not at all necessary, where each heart lies open, contemplating the book of life."<sup>18</sup>

If in the 12th century, why not also in the 9th? Of course, just as texts could be added to melodies, so they might be taken away, under the influence of a reformer with more sober, or simply different, tastes. But that is just one more aspect of the many-sided early development and transmission of the sequence repertory.

---

<sup>18</sup> "Et quia laudes aeternae vitae humanis verbis non resonabunt, quaedam ecclesiae mystice pneumatizant sequentiam sine verbis. Nulla enim verborum significatio necessaria, ubi corda singulorum patebunt singulis singulis librum vitae intuentibus." The work is edited in *Patrologiae Latinae* Tomus 177, among the works of Hugh of St. Victor, an attribution not now accepted: see B. Hauréau, *Les Oeuvres de Hugues de Saint-Victor*, Paris 1886, repr. Frankfurt/Main 1963, p.199 et seq. The incentive to look at this passage, and the Cluny evidence, came from Christopher Hohler, in: *Journal of the Plainsong & Medieval Music Society* 2 (1979), pp.65-67.

Germany: "Iustus ut palma maior", *Laus tibi...cui sapit* (Innocents), *Sancti baptiste* (John Bapt.), *Tuba nostrae vocis* (Martin)

### 11 De Natl Dni

Winchester: "Musa", *Caelica resonent* (Christmas)  
 Aquitaine: "Christi odierna", *Christi hodierna*, *Celica resonent*, *Hodie puer natus est*, *Laudemus Christum* (all Christmas)  
 Germany: "Mater", *Pangamus creatoris* (Easter), *Laudes Christo redempti* (Easter), *Congaudent angelorum* (BMV), *Omnis sexus et aetas* (Maurice)  
 remarks: melody in Autun 285, *Christi hodierna* text in Verona XC, clm 14843

### 12 De Epiphania

Winchester: "Chorus", "Bavverisca", *Epiphaniam domino* (Epiphany)  
 Aquitaine: "Epiphaniam", "Ecce vicit radix", *Epiphaniam domino* (Epiphany), *Ecce vicit* (John Ev., Easter)  
 Germany: "Concordia", *Hanc concordi* (Stephen), *Petre summe* (Peter and Paul)

### 13 De Pascha

Winchester: "Pascha nostrum", *Pange turba corda* (Easter)  
 Aquitaine: "Paschalis antica", "Beata tu", *Hec est vera redemptio* (Easter, Beata tu virgo (BMV)), *Gaudens mater* (Easter), *Exultet nunc* (Martin)  
 Germany: "Cignea", *Gaude Maria virgo* (BMV, Octave of Christmas)  
 remarks: *Beata tu virgo* text also in Verona XC, clm 14843

### 14 De Ascensio

Winchester: "Cithara", *Rex omnipotens* (Ascension)  
 Aquitaine: "Rex omnipotens", *Rex omnipotens* (Ascension)  
 Germany: "Occidentana", *Sancti spiritus assit* (Pentecost)

### 15 98r De Pentecoste

Winchester: "Benedicta", *Benedicta sit* (Pentecost)  
 Aquitaine: "Benedicta", *Benedicta sit*, *Benedicta semper* (both for Trinity)  
 Germany: "Trinitatis" (B), *Benedicta semper* (Trinity)

### 16 In Natl Aplor,

Winchester: "In omnem terram", *Laude iocunda* (Peter and Paul)  
 Aquitaine: "Laude iocunda", *Laude iocunda* (Peter and Paul)

### 17 Beatus vir

Winchester: "Beatus vir", *Gloriosa dies adest* (Stephen)  
 Aquitaine: "Gloriosa dies adest", *Gloriosa dies adest* (Stephen)  
 Germany: "Beatus vir qui timet", *Sacerdotem Christi Martinum* (Martin)  
 remarks: *Gloriosa dies* text also in clm 14843

### 18 Os iusti

Aquitaine: "Hos iusti", *Alle boans luia* (Valeria)

### 19 Musa

Winchester: "Angelica", "Nobilissima", *Candida contio* (Saints, Germanus of Auxerre)  
 Aquitaine: "Clara gaudia", *Dic nobis* (Easter), *Clara gaudia* (Easter), *Candida contio* (Germanus, Martin)

Germany: "Romana", *Johannes Jesu Christo* (John Ev.), *Laurenti David* (Lawrence)

20

## Stans a longe

Winchester: "Stans a longe", *Stans a longe* (Sundays)

Aquitaine: "Stans a longe", "Planctus publicani", *Stans a longe* (Sundays), *Laetabunda* (Easter), *Verba cuncta* (Sundays), *Rex eterne dominator* (Sundays), *Adest enim festa* (Paris 1084 only; Easter), *Cuncta simul instantia* (Easter)

Germany: "Metensis minor", *Sancti belli celebremus* (Maurice), *Pangat ymnum Augiensis* (Januarius), *Laude dignum sanctum* (Otmar), *Prompta mente* (Trinity)

21

## Mirabilis

Winchester: "Mirabilis deus", *Mirabilis deus* (Martyrs)

Aquitaine: "Mirabilis", *Mirabilis deus*, *Te collaudant* (both for Martyrs)

22 98v

## &lt; illegible &gt;

remarks: unicum

23

## Una faba

remarks: unicum; the titles of sequence melodies are often curious, but "faba" (a horse-bean) is particularly surprising.

24

## &lt; Edu &gt; x &lt; it &gt; dnus

Winchester: "Eduxit dominus", *Prome casta contio* (Easter)

Aquitaine: "Eduxit dominus", *Prome casta contio* (Easter)

25

## &lt; illegible &gt;

Winchester: "Berta vetula", *Arce summa* (Sundays)

Aquitaine: "Alme sanctorum", *Alme sanctorum* (Sundays, Saints)

remarks: also in Chartres 47

26

## Multifarie

Winchester: "Multifarie", *Nato canunt* (Christmas)

Aquitaine: "Multifarie", *Nato canant* (Christmas)

27

## Dnus regnavit

Winchester: "Dominus regnavit", *Nostra tuba nunc tua* (Christmas)

Aquitaine: "Nostra tuba", *Nostra tuba nunc tua* (Christmas?), *Christe tua agmina* (Sundays?)

Germany: "Nostra tuba", *Nostra tuba regatur* (Sundays after Epiphany)

remarks: *Nostra tuba regatur* text in clm 14843; text only of *Christe tua agmina* in Verona XC, Paris 1084 and 1118

28

## Dne refugium

Winchester: "Domine refugium", *Laude canora* (Saints)

Aquitaine: *Succinat cantibus* (Confessors)

remarks: melody also in Autun 28S

## CAMBRAI 75 - CONTENTS

- | no. fol. | name   |
|----------|--|
| 1 21v    | Ostende nobis domine   |
|          | Winchester: "Ostende" <i>Salus eterna</i> (Advent)   |
|          | Aquitaine: <i>Salus eterna, Veniet rex</i> , etc. (various related melodies; Advent)   |
|          | Germany: "Aurea", <i>Clare sanctorum</i> (Apostles)  |
| 2        | Letatus sum  |
|          | Winchester: "Letatus sum", <i>Regnantem sempiterna</i> (Advent)  |
|          | Aquitaine: "Letatus sum", <i>Regnantem sempiterna</i> (Advent), <i>Pangat laudes digne</i> (Advent)  |
|          | Germany: "Laetatus sum", <i>Psallat ecclesia</i> (Dedication)  |
| 3        | Excita   |
|          | remarks: not the short, a-parallel melody common in the West, but a double-versicle one (still short), also building on the All. <i>Excita domine</i> incipit. Found later texted in Cambrai and Arras books <i>Excita domine magnam potentiam</i> .   |
| 4        | Multifarie   |
|          | = Angers 144, no.26  |
| 5        | Christi hod < ierna >  |
|          | = Angers 144, no.11  |
| 6        | Beatus vir   |
|          | = Angers 144, no.17  |
| 7 22r    | Iustus ut palma  |
|          | = Angers 144, no.10  |
| 8        | Iubilemus  |
|          | Winchester: "Adducentur", "Dulcedine paradisi", <i>Deo promat, Laude Christum, Alme Hiesu</i> (all for Virgins)  |
|          | Aquitaine: "Iubilemus", "Veni domine", <i>Iubilemus omnes</i> (Advent), <i>En virginum</i> (Virgins), <i>Laus beata</i> (4th Sunday of Advent)   |
|          | Germany: "Adducentur", <i>Stirpe Maria regia</i> (Nativity of BMV)   |
| 9        | Illuxit  |
|          | = Angers 144, no.12  |
|          | remarks: although the Epiphany liturgy is naturally full of references to the "light of Jerusalem" and the star which shone for the Magi, there is no obvious source for the sequence title "Illuxit"; the word is not found in the well-known Epiphany sequence text <i>Epiphaniam domino</i> . |
| 10       | -  |
|          | = Angers 144, no.5   |
| 11 22v   | Maris stella   |
|          | Winchester: "Maris stella", <i>Salve porta</i> (Nativity of BMV)   |

Aquitaine: "Salve", *Salve porta* (Purification, Assumption)

- 12 Pascha nostrum  
= Angers 144, no.13
- 13 Fulgens  
Winchester: "Fulgens preclara", *Fulgens preclara* (Easter)  
Aquitaine: "Fulgens", *Fulgens preclara* (Easter), *Celsa personet* (Pontius)  
remarks: melody copied with partial text *Rex in eternum*
- 14 23r Tympanum  
Winchester: "Tympanum", *Aule rutila/celestis micantem* (Augustine of Canterbury)  
remarks: also in Paris 1087, no.B18, edited below
- 15 Rex omnipotens  
= Angers 144, no.14
- 16 Mater  
= Angers 144, no.6  
remarks: this is the version for *Alle celeste* and *Exulta celum* (see Angers 144, nos.6-7)
- 17 -  
= Angers 144, no.15
- 18 23v Angelica  
= Angers 144, no.19
- 19 Pretiosa  
Winchester: "Pretiosa", *Gaudet clemens, Almae caelorum* (both for All Saints)  
Aquitaine: "Iudicabunt", "O alma trinitas", *O alma trinitas deus es* (All Saints, other saints)  
remarks: melody copied with partial text *Iam nunc intonant*
- 20 Ecce pulchra  
= Angers 144, no.8
- 21 24r Haec est sancta  
Winchester: "Haec est sancta", *Christicolarum sacrosancta* (Saints), *Aulae plebs etherae* (Saints)  
Aquitaine: *Haec est sancta sollemnitas* (Stephen, John Ev.)  
Germany: "Virgo plorans", *Haec est sancta* (Easter)  
remarks: "western" *Haec est sancta sollemnitas* text in Verona XC and clm 14843
- 22 Gaudete  
Aquitaine: "Deus iudex", *Fortis atque amara* (Sundays)  
Germany: "Deus iudex iustus", *Judicem nos inspicientem* (2nd Sunday after Easter)  
remarks: title refers to All. *Gaudete iusti in domino*
- 23 Dicite in g <entibus >  
remarks: in the 13th-century St. Vaast gradual Arras Bibl.mun. 437 with text *Age dum nunc electus*, for the Finding of the Holy Cross (edited below); the title derives from an alleluia commonly sung on that feast.



## PARIS 1087 - CONTENTS

no. fol.	text	rubric	
	101v	Incipiunt prose annuis festivatibus dicende	
A1	102r = Angers 144, no.11	Caelica resonant	
A2	102v = Angers 144, no.12	Epyphaniam domino	In die Aepiphaniae
A3	103r = Cambrai 75, no.13 remarks: partial text <i>Rex in eternum</i> also in melody in margin, which necessitates the adoption of a minute hand	Fulgens preclara	De sancto Pascha
A4	104r = Angers 144, no.14	Rex omnipotens	De Ascensione
A5	104v (as previous)	Sancti spiritus adsit	De Pentecosten
A6	105v = Angers 144, no.16	Laude iocunda	Prosa de Apostolis Petro & Paulo
A7	106r De sancto Benedicto prosa Aquitaine: "Iustus germinabit", <i>Quem superne tripudiatim</i> (Benedict), <i>Aetherea laudent</i> (Benedict), <i>Auriflua comant</i> (Gerald), <i>Valde lumen</i> (Martial)	Quem superne tripudiatim	
A8	107r = Angers 144, no.5	Hac clara die turma	In Assumptione sancte Marie
A9	107v Winchester: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Arguta plectro</i> (Martyrs) Aquitaine: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Precelsa seclis</i> (Vincent), <i>Hodierna dies --rutilat</i> (All Saints), <i>Alludat letus</i> (Maurice), <i>Phoebus nunc pollens</i> (All Saints) remarks: see also below, C1	Alludat laetus ordo	De sancto Mauritio sociisque eius

no.	fol.	name	rubric
	108r	(continues without in a break from the preceding)	Incipiunt melodie annuales festivitatum dicendae
B1	108r	- Winchester: "Ostende", <i>Precamur nostras</i> (Advent)	

Aquitaine: "Ostende", *Precamur nostras* (Advent)  
 Germany: (later used for *Grates nunc omnes*, Christmas)  
 remarks: melody also in Autun 285; for Schlager K271

B2 108v -  
 = Cambrai 75, no.1

B3 Letatus sum  
 = Cambrai 75, no.2

B4 Excita domine  
 Winchester: "Excita domine", *Qui regis sceptris* (Advent)  
 Aquitaine: "Excita", *Qui regis sceptris* (Advent)  
 Germany: "Laudate deum", *Angelorum ordo sacer* (Michael)  
 remarks: short, a-parallel, for Schlager K205

B5 Nato canant  
 = Angers 144, no.26

B6 Nostra tuba  
 Winchester: "Dominus regnavit", *Nostra tuba nunc tua* (Christmas)  
 Aquitaine: "Nostra tuba", *Nostra tuba nunc tua* (Christmas?), *Christe tua agmina*  
 (Sundays?)  
 Germany: "Nostra tuba", *Nostra tuba regatur* (Sundays after Epiphany)  
 remarks: *Nostra tuba regatur* text in clm 14843; text only of *Christe tua agmina* in  
 Verona XC, Paris 1084 and 1118

B7 Gloriosa dies adest  
 = Angers 144, no.17

B8 109r Iustus ut palma  
 = Angers 144, no.10

B9 Ecce pulcra De Martiribus  
 = Angers 144, no.8

B10 Pangat vox humana  
 Aquitaine: "Adest", *Celebranda*, *Adest una*, *Pangat vox* (all Christmas)  
 remarks: partial text *Ecce puerpera genuit*

B11 109v Claris vocibus  
 = Angers 144, no.9

B12 Adest pascha Christi  
 Winchester: "Pascha nostrum", *Pange turba corda* (Easter)  
 Aquitaine: "Paschalis antica", "Beata tu", *Hec est vera redemptio* (Easter, *Beata tu*  
*virgo* (BMV)), *Gaudens mater* (Easter), *Exuliet nunc* (Martin)  
 Germany: "Cignea", *Gaude Maria virgo* (BMV, Octave of Christmas)  
 remarks: *Beata tu virgo* text also in Verona XC, clm 14843; the title refers to the text  
*Adest namque pascha Christi* (found in Angers, Tours and Paris sources)



- B24                                Stans a longe  
= Angers 144, no.20
- B25                                111r        Letabitur iustus  
Winchester: "Letabitur iustus", *Laurea clara* (Lawrence), *Fulget dies iucunda* (Iustus)  
Aquitaine: "Letabitur", *Concelebremus* (Martial)
- B26                                Alle celeste  
= Angers 144, no.6  
remarks: this is the version for *Alle celeste* and *Exulta celum* (see Angers 144, nos.6-7)
- B27                                Observanda  
Winchester: "Adorabo", *Angelice turme* (Sundays?)  
Aquitaine: "Observanda", "Laetetur", *Observanda*, *Letetur et concrepet*, *Castrorum proles* (all Dedication)  
remarks: partial text *Suscipe laus angelorum*
- B28                                Nunc crucis alme  
remarks: this manuscript is one of the earliest sources of the melody (and the text *Nunc crucis alme* is already indicated) of a sequence found later at St. Magloire, Cambrai and in some Norman uses.
- 
- | no.   | fol. | text   | rubric                            |
|-------|------|--|-----------------------------------|
| C1    | 111v | Precelsa seclis  | Prosa de sancto Vincentio colitur |
|       |      | Winchester: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Arguta plectro</i> (Martyrs)   |                                   |
|       |      | Aquitaine: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Precelsa seclis</i> (Vincent), <i>Hodierna dies rutilat</i> (All Saints), <i>Alludat letus</i> (Maurice), <i>Phoebus nunc pollens</i> (All Saints)                |                                   |
|       |      | remarks: see also above, A9  |                                   |
| ----- |      |  |                                   |
| no.   | fol. | text   | rubric                            |
| D1    | 117v | Clara chorus dulce pangat<br>(no music)  |                                   |
|       |      | remarks: text of a sequence for the Dedication, a contrafactum of the popular St. Nicholas sequence <i>Congaudentes exultemus</i>  |                                   |
| D2    | 118r | Celeste organum  |                                   |
|       |      | remarks: a relatively late (probably 12th c.) Christmas sequence, sparsely disseminated in France, more popular in England (see note 13, on Peter the Venerable's Statute regarding this sequence) |                                   |

TABLE 1  
CAMBRAI 75 AND LATER ARRAS BOOKS

## Melody

no.		
1		
2		
3		
4	Nato canunt	437, 444 (Christmas Day, 2nd mass), 1491 (1st mass)
5	Christi hodierna	1491 (Christmas Day, 3rd mass)
6		
7	Oramus te	444, 1491 (John Ev.)
8		
9	Epiphaniam	1491 (Epiphany)
10	Hac clara die	1491 (Annunciation)
11		
12		
13	Fulgens preclara	437, 444, 1491 (Easter Sunday)
14		
15	Rex omnipotens	437, 1497 (Ascension)
16	Exulta celum	1491 (John Bapt.)
17	Benedicta semper	437, 1491 (Trinity)
18		
19	O alma trinitas deus	437 (Ragnulph), 444
20	Ecce pulchra	437, 444 (Peter and Paul)
21		
22		
23	Age dum electus	437 (Finding of Holy Cross)
24	Mirabilis deus	437, 444 (Saints)
25		
26		
27		
28		
29	? (last line "A deo consecutus est... relaxantur delicta")	444 (John Bapt.?)
30	Christo inclyta	444 (All Saints, but at end of collection)

## ANGERS 144 - CONTENTS

- | no. | fol. | rubric or melody name  |
|-----|------|--|
| 1   | 95v  | Feria iiii post Pascha<br>Winchester: "Quoniam deus maior", <i>Promere chorda</i> (Martin)   |
| 2   |      | Atendite<br>remarks: also in Chartres 47   |
| 3   | 96r  | -<br>remarks: unicum   |
| 4   |      | -<br>Winchester: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Arguta plectro</i> (Martyrs)<br>Aquitaine: "Iusti epulentur", <i>Precelsa seclis</i> (Vincent), <i>Alludat letus</i> (Maurice), <i>Hodierna dies rutilat</i> (All Saints), <i>Phoebus nunc pollens</i> (All Saints)   |
| 5   | 97r  | Post partum<br>Winchester: "Post partum", "Greca pulchra", <i>Hac clara die</i> (Assumption)<br>Aquitaine: "Post partum", "A clara die", <i>Hac clara die</i> (Annunciation, Assumption)   |
| 6   |      | In nativitate sce Mariae<br>Winchester: "Mater sequentiarum", <i>Alle caeleste</i> (Annunciation), <i>Exulta celum</i> (John Bapt.)<br>Aquitaine: "Mater sequentiarum", "Rex alme", "Ad celebres", <i>Rex alme deus</i> (Saints), <i>Ad celebres</i> (Michael), <i>Alle caeleste</i> (Nativity of BMV)   |
| 7   |      | De sco Michaelae<br>remarks: much of the melody is identical with no.6, and is counted here as equivalent. In fact no.6 is the version found with texts <i>Alle caeleste</i> (BMV) and <i>Exulta celum</i> (John Bapt.), whereas no.7 is the version found with texts <i>Ad celebres</i> (Michael) and <i>Rex alme</i> (Saints)  |
| 8   |      | De omnibus scis<br>Winchester: "Lira", <i>Lira pulchra</i> (Saints), <i>Ecce pulchra</i> (Saints, Michael)<br>Aquitaine: "Vexilla", <i>Ecce pulchra</i> (All Saints), <i>Vexilla regis</i> (Holy Cross), <i>Agnus dei Christus</i> (Easter)  |
| 9   | 97v  | De sco Martino<br>Winchester: "Adorabo", <i>Claris vocibus</i> (Purification)<br>Aquitaine: "Virgo Israel", <i>Exultet elegantis</i> (Dedication), <i>Virgo Israel</i> (Purification), <i>Claris vocibus</i> (Purification), <i>Christo inclyta</i> (All Saints), <i>Nova gratia</i> (Hilary), <i>Voce precelsa</i> (Peter), <i>Ad templi huius</i> (Dedication)<br>Germany: "Eia turma", <i>Eia recolamus</i> (Christmas), <i>Eia fratres cari</i> (Otmars) |
| 10  |      | De sco Andreae<br>Winchester: "Iustus ut palma", <i>Laus armonie</i> , <i>Organicis modulis</i> , <i>Oramus te</i> (all John Ev.)<br>Aquitaine: "Iustus ut palma", "Haec dies", "Organicis", "Prefulgida", <i>Haec dies est sancta</i> (Christmas), <i>Organicis canamus</i> (John Ev.), <i>Prefulgida dies</i> (Andrew), <i>Da camena</i> (John Bapt.), <i>Nativitas precursoris</i> (John Ev.)   |

TABLE 2

## LITURGICAL ASSIGNMENT OF CLUNY SEQUENCE MELODIES

B1	1st Sunday in Advent
B2	1st Sunday in Advent
B3	2nd Sunday in Advent
B4	3rd Sunday in Advent
B5	Christmas Day, 1st Mass (Missa in Gallicantu)
B6	Christmas Day, 2nd Mass (Missa in Luce)
A1	Christmas Day, 3rd Mass (Missa Maiora)
B7	Stephen
B8	John Evangelist
B9	Innocents
B10	Octave of the Nativity
A2	Epiphany
B11	Purification
A3	Easter Sunday
B12	Easter week
B13	Easter week
B14	Easter week
B15	Easter week
A4	Ascension
A5	Whitsunday
B16	Whitsuntide
B17	Whitsuntide
B18	Whitsuntide
B19	Trinity
B20	John Baptist (June 24)
A6	Peter & Paul (June 29)
A7	Translation of Benedict (July 11)
B21	Lawrence (August 10)
A8	Assumption of the Blessed Virgin (August 15)
A9	Maurice (September 22)



'Dicite in gentibus'

1.   
 A E V A

2.   
 J.: M. | J.: | J.: M. |

3.   
 J.: | 1. 5 4. A | 1.: M. |

4.   
 J.: | 1 5 J.: | 1 5 4. J.: | 1 5

5.   
 A A 1 5 4. A | 1.: M. |

6.   
 A A m. 1 5 4. A | 1.: M. |

7. same as 4.

8. same as 5.

9.